

## **COURSE SYLLABUS 2017-18**

# **Anthropological Approaches to Ethnicity, Racism and Nationalism - With Special Reference to Rom and Romany Peoples**

**Instructor:** Michael Stewart, Visiting Professor

Department: Nationalism Studies Program

Central European University

2017 – 2018 Fall & Winter Semesters (4-10 Dec and 12-16 Feb).

Course level: MA

#2 Credits (# 4ECTS Credits)

Course e-learning site: <http://ceulearning.ceu.edu/course/view.php?id=4350>

### **Course Description**

The first days of the course – in the last week of term (December 4-8) – we examine the usefulness of certain key ideas drawn from the sociology of nationalism. Through a series of ethnographic examples we consider problems of political relativism vis a vis the 'invention of tradition' literature and then the particular form nationalist movements and conflicts take. At this point we take our first look at the Romani case – considering tradition, history and the commemoration of WW2. We then broaden the focus to look at the nature of 'religious nationalism' in South Asia, and consider the fit or lack of fit of received theoretical models: both Gellner and Anderson link nationalism to

the disenchantment of the world/secularism - does the experience of S Asia undermine their stance? Ethnographies of violence are then considered as a field in which empirical, field or historical research profoundly alters a priori wisdom. This part of the course concludes with a reflection on the comparative study of modern racisms in the USA and Europe.

In the second part of the course – in February- we turn to questions of race, class and ethnicity in Europe, focusing on the Roma in some detail, but including discussions of Islamophobia and headscarf bans. The course concludes with a pair of broad discussions of the fashionable notion of 'identity politics' and the even more fashionable cult of 'intersectionality' asking what has been achieved when politics becomes a struggle for 'identity' and 'voice'. We also examine the new anti-Romany politics to be found in many countries of the EU, not just among the 'bad-boys' of the east.

This course is complementary to Julia Szalai's course on poverty, policy & Roma and may profitably be taken together. Indeed, we highly recommend that you take both courses - but you can, of course, take one without the other. There are also other courses in the University offered within the Roma Studies program that will also be complementary to this.

### Organisation of course and classes

The course will be composed of lectures, class-based discussions-cum-seminars and two (or more) films with associated debate.

For each session two or three students will be required to prepare a single sheet of A4 presenting an article on the discussion list for that day in the format of ARGUMENT, QUESTION, CONNECTIONS, AND IMPLICATIONS: AQCI - as explained below (PLEASE READ RIGHT THROUGH!). THE AQCI'S MUST BE SUPPLIED IN COPIES ENOUGH FOR EACH MEMBER OF THE CLASS TO

RECEIVE ONE.

In mid September, I will hold an introductory meeting in which I will introduce this course and, provisionally, allocate readings so students can prepare for the intensive work in December. The second part of my course will take place in February. Deadlines for course essays are just after the end of that term.

### **Learning Outcomes**

By the end of this course, students will be able to:

- Determine the usefulness of certain key ideas drawn from the sociology and anthropology of nationalism when considering the situation of Romany populations
- Assess the balance of 'race', economic position and ethnicity in shaping the experience of Romany populations today
- Critically discuss the 'politics of identity' and assess what happens when politics becomes struggle for 'identity' both with reference to minorities and new populist xenophobic movements
- Draft concise but comprehensive precis of academic texts as well as write in a scholarly fashion in other modes than essay (e.g. film review)

### **Course Requirements**

## Assessment

Marking for the course will be based 35% on the two AQCI's handed in; 15% on a two page film review of one of the films screened during the course to be handed in ten days after the last session in February and 50% on an essay of 2,500 words length on a topic related to the course AND TITLE TO BE AGREED BY Professor Stewart. The deadline for handing in the essay will be the SECOND MONDAY after the end of full term in the spring. This will allow students several weeks after the course to complete this essay including one full week of holiday.

In each class, the discussion will be based around the AQCI's presented. Those who do not have to prepare an AQCI need not but may find it helpful nonetheless to do so in order to structure their reading and thinking. (Only two AQCI's will be marked per person.) AQCI's should be written on a single reading.

The structure of an AQCI should be as follows (i.e. you should keep the numbered paragraph structure).

ARGUMENT, QUESTION, CONNECTIONS, AND IMPLICATIONS: AQCI

1. CENTRAL QUOTATION. Quote a sentence (or excerpts from linked sentences) from the text that you think is central to the author's (or authors') implicit or explicit argument(s). Always cite the page.

2. ARGUMENT. In a few sentences – up to half the A4 page - state the author's explicit or implicit argument. Be sure to include both: what the author is arguing for, and what s/he is arguing against. This is the most challenging part of the exercise and brilliant, condensed precis will win you high points.

3. QUESTION. Raise a question which you think is not fully, or satisfactorily,

answered by the text. The question should be a question of interpretation or of inquiry, not simply a question of fact.

4. EXPERIENTIAL CONNECTION. Say, in a few lines only, how the argument confirms or contradicts your own experience or common sense.

5. TEXTUAL CONNECTION. Connect the argument of this text to an argument or point you find in another reading assignment covered in this course or one you have picked up from earlier study at CEU or elsewhere. Present a quote from the other text (citing it properly), and explain how the present text's argument contrasts with, contradicts, confirms, clarifies, or elaborates the other text's argument or point.

6. IMPLICATIONS. Lay out what this argument (#2 above) implies for understanding or improving society, relations between individuals, or groups (e.g., inter-ethnic, nations, etc.) or any facet of social or cultural reality (a few sentences only).

AQCI should not exceed one typed page. They should be typed or word-processed, proofread and printed with the same degree of care as other essays.

**NB By far the most difficult part of the AQCI is the precis of an article into 10-12 lines. This is a fundamental transferrable skill that you should all acquire before leaving. Here is your chance to practice!**

## **Readings:**

The e-learning site contains all materials listed for class readings. All other materials with are to be found in the library as photocopied material. There is

also a large amount of photocopied material from the SUN Summer School, The Plight of the Gypsies/The Roma that has run from 1999 through 2014, which the Librarian can also make available for you.

### **Brief Summary of Topics:**

## **Class 1 - Inventing Traditions in the post-colonial world**

Woost, Michael 1990 [Rural Awakenings; grassroots development and the cultivation of a national past in rural Sri Lanka](#), pp. 164-183 in Spencer ed.

BELOW

Blasco, Gay y Paloma 2011 [Agata's Story: singular lives and the reach of the 'Gitano Law'](#), in JRAI 2009, Vol. 17, no. 3: pp. 445-461. (Direct link to come 17.09.13)

**Topics for discussion:** Does the notion of 'invented tradition' degrade and denigrate the efforts of the powerless or newly empowered to validate their own history? What does the social analyst do when caught up in the claims and counterclaims of those they study?

## **Lecture 1: Operationalising Anderson and Gellner: The lessons of extra European nationalisms (Sri Lanka, the Pacific and the problem of 'invented traditions')**

(for readings and more details of all lectures please consult the electronic reading list)

## ***Class 2 - Inventing Traditions in Europe***

**Topic:** Discuss the notion that contemporary citizens of Greece or the Roma are descendants of ancient Greeks/ Indians. What is the idea of a cultural 'survival'? Is this an acceptable theoretical term?

Is Kapralski arguing for the invention of Romani tradition? What are the preconditions and what are the implications of this normative stance?

Danforth, Loring M. 1984 [The Ideological Context of the Search for Continuities in Greek Culture](#), *Journal of Modern Greek Studies*.

Hancock, Ian 1997 [The Struggle for the Control of Identity](#), in *Transitions*, Sept. pp 36-44.

Willems, Wim [Ethnicity as a death trap: the history of Gypsy studies](#), pp. 17-34 in Lucassen et al. ed below

**Kapralski S. L.** [The Holocaust in the Memory of the Roma: from Trauma to Imagined Community?](#), in Stillman and G. Johanson (eds.) *Constructing and Sharing Memory. Community Informatics, Identity and Empowerment*. Newcastle 2007:

**Stewart, M.** 2004 [Remembering without Commemoration](#), *JRAI*, Volume 10, Issue 3, September 2004, Pages 561–582

**Kapralski S.** [Memory Identity and Roma Transnational Nationalism](#), in *Transnational Memory*, 19 *Circulation, Articulation, Scales*

## **Lecture 2: Folklore, ethnography and nation in South Eastern Europe**

### ***Class 3 - 'Religious nationalism'***

**Topic:** What is the nature of religious nationalism and can we see parallels in Europe? Why was the conflict over Ayodha been so important for Hindu nationalists? What cultural and symbolic strategies have been adopted by Hindu nationalists to reframe national historical myths? What is the role of publicly staged conflicts in the power struggles of populist parties?

Hansen, T.H. 1999 Hindu Nationalism and Democracy in India & Modernity, Nation and Democracy, in *The Saffron Wave: Democracy and Hindu Nationalism in Modern India*, Princeton. Read Introduction only. Available in library and in Nat Studies library.

Kapur, A. 1993 [From Deity to Crusader: the changing iconography of Ram](#), in Pandey G. (ed.) *Hindus and Others: the question of Identity in India Today*, New Delhi ; New York : Viking.

Pollock, S. 1993 [Ramayana and political imagination in India](#), *Journal of Asian Studies* 52, pp 261-297

Froerer, P. 2006. ['Emphasizing Others: the Emergence of Hindu Nationalism in a Central Indian Tribal Community'](#). In *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 12: 39-59.

## **Lecture 3: Religion and nation the case of India**



## ***Class 4 - Interpreting Ethnic Violence***

Topics for discussion: What is the role of the external commentator? How are we to make sense of conflicts like that in Bosnia in the early 1990s? How have social scientists become complicit in symbolic violence? How do victims try to make sense of violence?

Sorabji, Cornelia 1994 [A very modern War](#), in H. Watson and R. Hinde eds. War: a cruel necessity: the bases of institutionalised violence, London/New York, I.B. Tauris

Kakar, S. 1996 The colours of Violence: cultural identities, religion and conflict  
[Chapter Three - Warriors.](#)

Das, V. 1990 [Our Work to Cry, Your Work to Listen](#), in Mirrors of Violence: Communities, Riots, Survivors Oxford, Oxford University Press

Das, V. 2004 [The force of the local, from Life and Words: Violence and the Descent into the Ordinary](#)

## **Lecture 4: Political violence: myths and realities**

## ***Class 5 - How relevant is the American experience of 'Race' in Europe today?***

### **Topics for discussion:**

Many organisations in Europe use a model of race relations drawn from American history, inspired by the heroic tale of the civil rights movement overthrowing a century of legalised discrimination that followed the

emancipation of the slaves. What problems arise when we transpose descriptive models derived from one region of the world to another? Are Roma the 'Blacks' of Europe? If not, what are the implications for human rights' organisations and the like?

Gates, Henry L. 1996 [White Like Me](#), in The New Yorker, June 17

## **Lecture 5: Race and class: The USA and Europe Compared**

### ***Class 6 – Screening of Dumitru Budrala's *The Curse of the Hedgehog* and discussion.***

Budrala's film is one of the very visual ethnographies of a Romany population.

Points to consider while watching:

What attitudes to time and economizing behaviour do we witness?

How is power contested in trading relationships between the *Baiesi* and the farmers?

What sort of performances do we witness in the course of the film?

### ***Class 7 - What is the Roma/Gypsy niche in capitalist societies?***

**Topics for discussion:** what models of 'ethnicity' have anthropologists used when discussing Roma? What is understood by 'passing'? How do you assess the 'social constructionist' position derived from Okely? What are the

implications for research and for political action of Matras's categorical distinction between, as he puts it, GYPSY 1 and GYPSY 2.

Williams, Patrick 1982 [The Invisibility of the Kalderash of Paris: Some aspects of the economic activity and settlement patterns of the Kalderash Rom of the Paris suburbs](#), pp 315-344, in Urban Anthropology, 11 no 3-4

Blasco, Gay y 2002 [Gypsy/Roma Diasporas: Introducing a Comparative Perspective](#). Social Anthropology, vol. 10, no. 2, pp. 173-188.

Matras, Yaron, 2003 [The Role of Language in mystifying and de-mystifying Gypsy identity](#), in Saul, N. & Tebbutt, S. eds. The role of the Romanies. Liverpool: Liverpool Univ. Press

Silverman, Carol 1988 [Negotiating Gypsiness: Strategies in Context](#), Journal of American Folklore, Vol. 100, pp.261-275

Fotta, Martin [2016] ['Only the dead don't make the future': Calon lives between non-Gypsies and death](#), forthcoming in JRAI

## **Lecture 7: How have ethnographers approached Roma/Gypsies?**

### ***Class 8 - How did communist assimilationist policies define 'the Gypsy Question'?***

What was the history of the treatment of Roma by state administrations in different parts of Europe? Why did Gypsies not fit communist models of

nation? Why did Gypsies become 'the other' of state socialism? What has been the legacy of socialism for the Roma?

Guy, Willie 1998 Ways of Looking at Roma: The Case of Czechoslovakia, in D. Tong ed. Gypsies: An Interdisciplinary Reader, New York: Garland

Stewart, Michael 2001 [The Development of Communist Policy towards Gypsies and Roma, 1945-1989. A Case Study](#), in W. Guy ed. Between past and future: the Roma of Central and Eastern Europe, Hertfordshire University Press

Lemon, Alaina [What is your nation? performing Romani distinctions](#), Chapter Three of Between Two Fires, Duke

Lucassen, Leo '[Between Hobbes and Locke. Gypsies and the limits of the modernization paradigm](#)', Social History 33 (2008) no. 4, 423-441.

Szalai, Julia nd. [Power and Poverty: Socialist Second Economy and Self-Protection Against Poverty in Hungary](#)

### **Lecture 8: Scapegoating the Gypsies from socialism to post-socialism**

The further away we get from the communist dictatorships, the more important that period in history seems for the current predicament Romany communities face. How did communist assimilationism reframe 'the Gypsy question' and what is the of that legacy today?

*Class 9 - What forms may Romany politics take in post-communist eastern Europe?*

**Topics:** How might the politics of everyday life and the politics of state policies meet? What difficulties do Roms face in constructing a politics of identity? How do you assess the claims of Budilova and Jakoubek? What

future is there for a new 'critical Romani studies' and what questions might it address?

Szuhay, Peter 1995 [Constructing a Gypsy National Culture](#), Budapest Review of Books, 5/3: 111-120

Day, Sophie, Papataxiarchis Evthymios, Stewart Michael 1998 [Consider the Lilies of the Field](#), pp. 1-24, in *Lilies of the Field: Marginal People who Live for the Moment*, Boulder: Westview

Jaboukek, Marek [Traditional Roma Culture and National Roma Culture: Definitions, Relations, Prospects \(The Czech/slovakian/ Case\)](#)

Klahn, Marett Katalin. 2015. Knowing Differently: On Thinking and Doing 'Roma'. in Roma Rights (Special Issue: Nothing About Us Without Us? Roma Participation in Policy Making and Knowledge Production). 2015 (2). Sourced at: <http://www.errc.org/article/roma-rights-2-2015-nothing-about-us-without-us-roma-participation-in-policy-making-and-knowledge-production/4433/9>

Matache, Margaret. 2016. "*The White Norm in Gypsy and Romani Studies*," a three part blog available at: [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/word-image-and-thought-creating-the-romani-other\\_us\\_57f29d40e4b095bd896a156a](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/word-image-and-thought-creating-the-romani-other_us_57f29d40e4b095bd896a156a)

Mirga-Kruszelnicka, Anna. 2015. Romani Studies and emerging Romani scholarship. in Roma Rights (Special Issue: Nothing About Us Without Us? Roma Participation in Policy Making and Knowledge Production). 2015 (2). Sourced at: <http://www.errc.org/article/roma-rights-2-2015-nothing-about-us-without-us-roma-participation-in-policy-making-and-knowledge-production/4433/6>

## **Lecture 9**

### **Poverty and Politics: Are the Roma the underclass of post communism**

Willems, W. & Lucassen, L. 2001 [Gypsies in the Diaspora? The Pitfalls of a Biblical Concept](#), in Histoire Social/Social History Ottawa, 2001

Matras, Yaron 2000 [Romani Migrations in the post communist Era: their historical and political significance](#), in Cambridge Review of International Affairs 12-2, 32-50.

Friedman, Victor [Problems in the codification of Romany as a Standard Literary language](#)

Szalai, Julia nd. [Struggles for Recognition at Odds: Clashing Interests of Gender and Ethnicity in Local Welfare in Contemporary Hungary](#).

Hannerz, Ulf 1969 Soulside: Inquiries into Ghetto Culture and Community, New York and London, Columbia University Press

Horvath, Kata 2005 [Gypsy Work - gadjo work](#), Romani Studies, Vol. 15, no. 1 pp 31-49

Wacquant, Loic 1998 The Prizefighter's Three Bodies, Ethnos: Journal of Anthropology, 63, no 3 pp. 325-352

Baar, Huub Van 2011 [Introduction](#) & [Chapter 7 "Traveling Activism in/against the Spirit of Neo-liberalism"](#): from The European Roma: Minority Representation and the limits of transnational governmentality - published PhD dissertation

### ***Class 10 – Screening of *The Headmaster and the Headscarves* (BBC2 2004) and class discussion.***

In 2004 ostentatious religious symbols and dress were banned in French schools. The film we screen covers the months leading up to and the days

immediately after the ban was imposed giving voice to a wide range of views and exploring the complex notion of *laicite*.

### ***Class 11 - What forms may Romany politics take in post-communist eastern Europe?***

**Topic:** How might the politics of everyday life and the politics of state policies meet? What difficulties do Roms face in constructing a politics of identity? How do you assess the claims of Budilova and Jakoubek? What future is there for a new 'critical Romani studies' and what questions might it address?

Szuhay, Peter 1995 [Constructing a Gypsy National Culture](#), Budapest Review of Books, 5/3: 111-120

Day, Sophie, Papataxiarchis Evthymios, Stewart Michael 1998 [Consider the Lilies of the Field](#), pp. 1-24, in *Lilies of the Field: Marginal People who Live for the Moment*, Boulder: Westview

Jaboukek, Marek [Traditional Roma Culture and National Roma Culture: Definitions, Relations, Prospects \(The Czech/oslovakian/ Case\)](#)

Klahn, Marett Katalin. 2015. Knowing Differently: On Thinking and Doing 'Roma'. in *Roma Rights (Special Issue: Nothing About Us Without Us? Roma Participation in Policy Making and Knowledge Production)*. 2015 (2). Sourced at: <http://www.errc.org/article/roma-rights-2-2015-nothing-about-us-without-us-roma-participation-in-policy-making-and-knowledge-production/4433/9>

Matache, Margaret. 2016. "*The White Norm in Gypsy and Romani Studies*," a three part blog available at: [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/word-image-and-thought-creating-the-romani-other\\_us\\_57f29d40e4b095bd896a156a](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/word-image-and-thought-creating-the-romani-other_us_57f29d40e4b095bd896a156a)

Mirga-Kruszelnicka, Anna. 2015. Romani Studies and emerging Romani scholarship. in *Roma Rights (Special Issue: Nothing About Us Without Us? Roma Participation in Policy Making and Knowledge Production)*. 2015 (2).

Sourced at: <http://www.errc.org/article/roma-rights-2-2015-nothing-about-us-without-us-roma-participation-in-policy-making-and-knowledge-production/4433/6>

## **Lecture 11: Poverty and Politics: Are the Roma the underclass of post communism**

### ***Class 12 - The Rise of Political Anti-Gypsyism***

We are now witnesses to a dangerous shift in the political salience of the language of radical exclusionism in European politics. We find elected officials, parties and civic movements for whom 'the problems with the Gypsies' lie at the heart of their imagined grievances. While an incorrigible opportunist like President Sarkozy has no personal agenda in targeting Roma migrants in France, in some parts of Europe these matters are genuinely and deeply felt. Parties have emerged in Bulgaria and Hungary, for instance, with significant public support, which, for the first time in Europe, use a language of absolute cultural difference to place 'the Gypsy menace' at the centre of their politics.

Questions for discussion:

Why are Roma the targets of a new form of exclusionary discourse in eastern Europe and elsewhere today? is it accurate and wise to talk of political anti-Gypsyism?

Is there a European-level pattern to anti-Gypsyism today?



How has the position of Roma changed in the public culture of post communist societies since 1990?

Class reading:

from Michael Stewart (ed.) *The Gypsy Menace* chapters by Georgia Efremova (Bulgaria) Kata Horvath and Cecilia Kovai (Hungary) and Giovanni Picker (Italy).

Blasco P Gay y - [It's the best school for them](#), forthcoming in Social Anthropology.

Further reading

Berezin, Mabel 2009 *Illiberal Politics in Neoliberal Times: Culture, Security, and Populism in the New Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Gingrich Andre and Banks, Marcus eds 2006 *Neo-nationalism in Europe and beyond: perspectives from social anthropology*, Berghahn Books

Holmes Douglas R. 2009. ["Experimental Identities \(After Maastricht\),"](#) in *European Identity*. Peter Katzenstein and Jeffery Checkel (eds.) pp. 52-80, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.